

日英の新聞から学ぶ ～現代英語教育や異文化理解教育に活用するための比較～

岡本洋太郎・山中マーガレット

岐阜女子大学 文化創造学部

(2021年11月9日受理)

Learning from British and Japanese Newspapers ～ A Comparison for Utilization in Contemporary English Education and Cross-Cultural Understanding Classrooms ～

Gifu Women's University, Department of Cultural Development

Yotaro Okamoto and Margaret Yamanaka

(Received November 9, 2021)

要 旨

新聞記事やジャーナリズムは、「現代英語」などの欧米のリベラルアーツ教育で長く親しまれてきたが、インターネットの発達などを背景に存在感が薄れている。日本の大学教育でも同じ傾向が見られ、国際コミュニケーションや英語力の強化をめざす教育政策上も問題になる可能性がある。日本のジャーナリズムは、記者クラブ制度の弊害などが弱点と指摘され、近年は世界「報道の自由度」ランキングでも低迷している。それでも、ハーマンとチョムスキーが提唱した概念「プロパガンダ・モデル」に照らして、日本のジャーナリズムは、おおむね他の先進国のように機能してきたといえる。新聞・ニュースはその国の価値観や観点を反映し、異文化理解の教材として有用だ。「不偏不党」「客観報道」が求められる日本の新聞と、支持政党や政治的立場を明確にする英国の新聞を比較・相対化すれば、歴史や文化、国民性などの相違を考える好材料になるだろう。

1. Teaching “Current English” and what lies beyond the News Article

Traditionally, all Liberal Arts courses and Liberal Arts electives for university freshmen included a “Current English” subject which either used a textbook that introduced the previous year’s news topics, or was built around viewing a daily English newspaper or student newspaper provid-

ed each week by the tutor in charge. With the advent of the internet, applications for previously unattainable news sites such as the BBC, and the general streamlining of general English subjects for freshmen, the inclination to teach journalism related English subjects has declined.

Not only is the academic community in Japan turning away from teaching “Current English” as a specialized subject, but, according to a 2013

survey done in the U.S. by the Poynter Institute's News University, professionals in the field of journalism no longer put great importance on getting a degree in journalism. They find that organized four-year degree programs fail to keep up with the ever-changing needs of the media industry, and that on-the-job training is now more beneficial. This situation may be problematic for Japan, especially considering the Ministry of Education's increasing sway towards global communication and raising a society of more competent English speakers. It is interesting to note, however, that one of the weak points of Japan's most popular tabloids is the fact that few reporters are graduates of journalism departments, and the majority only begin to learn their trade entering their newspaper, a job they expect to keep for life (Fackler, 2017).

Some international audiences also point out that Japanese journalism lacks investigative reporting and the articles are just like press releases dished by the authorities for infamous press clubs, *kisha kurabu* (Japan Today, 2016). Although the latter criticism may be acceptable, Japanese journalism has done quality investigative reporting, particularly in establishing its press freedom after the Second World War.

Japanese newspapers are mostly written in straight news formats which consists of purely essential facts and is compact in objective reporting. This style was firstly nurtured by the government's directions and regulations before the Second World War. The government oppressed anti-government newspapers triggered by the Freedom and People's Rights Movements in 19th century and supported moderate, impartial ones, sometimes with its investments. These then developed into the current national newspapers (Ariyama,

1986). Moreover, in 1945, the GHQ or General Head Quarters of the United Nations in occupied Japan released the Press Codes for Japan and forced Japanese media to be impartial, disregarding objective reporting completely, and not allowing reporters to criticize policies at all. Japan's newspaper association established the current platform following the codes the next year (Shimazaki, 1968).

To the contrary, UK newspapers contain many more feature stories which report from more individual viewpoints, and interpretative reporting which delivers not only the facts but also the backgrounds and prospects. One reason for this is because broadcasting and online media now deliver the facts more rapidly and audience demand is for deeper understanding requiring further reporting. The other difference is endorsement. UK newspapers, regardless of broadsheets or tabloids, have clear positions in politics and support political parties, so they announce their endorsements before the General Elections and Referendums. This is yet another difference between Western newspapers and Japanese ones. Media systems are firmly in the grip of nation-states, and there are no transnational media (Hafez, 2007). Therefore, news contents represent the media's own countries' values and viewpoints. It may be one of the main reasons why overseas news contents are beneficial for international understanding and global communications. Nevertheless, we still remain with the question: Does Japanese journalism work in the function of watchdog to powers as well as Western newspapers do?

Mosco (2008) defines that the political economy is "the study of social relations, particularly power relations, that mutually constitute the production, distribution, and consumption of resour-

es, including communication resources”. He sees this formulation has a certain practical value because it calls attention to how the communication business operates, for example, how communications products move through a chain of producers such as a Hollywood film studio, to wholesalers, retailers, and consumers, whose purchases, downloads, and attention are fed back into new processes of production.

2. The Propaganda Model

Scholars regard the propaganda model conceived by Herman and Chomsky (1988 ; 2002) as a useful tool for analysis of the political economy of media in most democratic, developed countries, such as the United States, the United Kingdom, France and Australia. The title of their book “Manufacturing Consent” is the phrase originally used by famous American critic Walter Lippmann in his book, *Public Opinion* published in 1922, which is described there as “manufacture of consent”. Chomsky was a prominent linguist who advocated a grammar theory and also known for anti-government actions such as the Vietnam anti-war. In the 1980s, he began developing his own media and propaganda theories. Herman was a professor specializing in corporate systems, especially media structure analysis. Their theory is drawn by carefully collecting and analysing the vast amount of primary materials such as newspapers, magazines, and television in each case, and reading and deriving relevant information from those documents. It may be described as a sober research.

The five filters of the propaganda model presented by Herman & Chomsky are as follows:

1 . Size, ownership and the profit orientation

of the mass media: the market dominance of the huge media group controls newspapers, magazines and television, and the interdependence between the media and government.

2 . Advertising licence to business: the mass media has a self-regulatory constitution in order to acquire readers and viewers with purchasing power, to sell them to advertisers, and to withhold criticism of the dominant class in return for the advertising revenue they earn.

3 . Sourcing mass-media news: the penetration of a sophisticated system on the side of the powers provides information to the media expediently and converges the media dispute within their favourable framework.

4 . Flak and the enforcers: organized media surveillance by the powers intensify media criticism when information unfavourable for them comes out.

5 . Anti-communism as a control mechanism: shared value of denying the existence of Soviet, Chinese and Cuban socialism has a profound influence on the mass media.

These five filters serve to regulate US media activity and contribute to the formation of disguised agreements. Case studies indicate that media imperialism is expected to form the world's consensus into an American style. Herman & Chomsky's 2002 edition shows no fundamental change from the 1988 edition. The authors acknowledge that in the 14 years between the old and new edition, the Internet was born and grew rapidly as an alternative to the old media. However, they also consider that the merger of the Internet with the old media, such as in the AOL Time

Warner case, has strengthened the media's control of the old regime. According to Herman & Chomsky, the collapse of socialism shortly after the release of the 1988 edition has not modified or abandoned the fifth model. Rather, terrorism has replaced anti-communism to become the fifth principle (Herman and Chomsky, 2002).

2. The Political Economy of Media in Japan

The propaganda model is observed to be quite applicable to Japan. This study will explore how the relationship between Japanese mass media and the powers works as the control mechanism of the propaganda model in each of the five filters.

1. Politicians played a vital role in establishing the broad constraints under which broadcasters operated. The state broadcaster Nippon Hoso Kyokai (NHK) was particularly vulnerable to political pressures. The prime minister appointed the members of its Board of Governors and enjoyed effective power of veto over appointment of NHK's president, while its budgets and investment plans required the approval of the Diet. NHK stressed factual reporting and avoided populist attacks on the party and government. In the 1960s and 1970s, NHK relied on the ruling Liberal Democratic Party (LDP)'s leading politician Kakuei Tanaka to deal with requests for rate increases through the Diet. Indeed, NHK Chairman Yoshiro Ono was seen as so close to Tanaka that one of his visits to the ex-prime minister who resigned due to a political scandal in 1976 led to Ono's subsequent resignation. In the early 1990s, Chairman Keiji Shima reportedly maintained good relations with Tanaka's

heir, Noboru Takeshita. NHK managers complained that the ruling party could capture NHK through its consent to increases in reception fees. In addition, Tanaka, when in power, was also in charge of granting television licenses to commercial broadcasters led by major newspaper companies (Noble, 2000).

The networks that formed around NHK were the four major Tokyo-area stations: Nippon TV (NTV), Fuji TV, the Tokyo Broadcasting System (TBS), and TV Asahi. The hub of each group is one of the five major daily newspapers which own and control their key stations directly and through personal links: the Yomiuri Shimbun owns NTV; the Sankei Shimbun and Fuji TV form Fuji/Sankei group; the Mainichi Shimbun owns TBS; the Asahi Shimbun owns TV Asahi; and the Nihon Keizai Shimbun, Japan's biggest business newspaper, is affiliated with the smaller TV Tokyo. Once the local station is launched, the shareholders such as banks, businesses and media groups join the network affiliated with it. Most of these stations rely on their network for national news shows and other nationwide programs (Oyama, 2015).

Because of their interdependence, all of the outsiders from the Japanese mass media failed the bid to take over the national TV networks. In 1996 Rupert Murdoch acquired 21.4 percent of Asahi National Broadcasting stock to kickstart his launch of his satellite television platform JSkyB shortly after the successful BskyB in UK. It inflamed the nationalist sentiments of the people and media industry because Japanese media groups have been maintaining an astonishing level of self-sufficiency in production, distribution, management, and ownership.

It resulted in a reduction of Murdoch's stock ownership in TV Asahi in the next year. He succeeded in entering Japan's satellite television market in 1999, but pulled out of it in 2003 (Choi, 2010). In 2005, the Japanese IT company Livedoor moved towards a hostile takeover of Fuji Television, and Japan's biggest online retailer, Rakuten, sought a hostile takeover of TBS. Both failed. (Oyama and Lolli, 2016)

2. Considering how the media has dealt with the issue of nuclear power, TEPCO, which owns the Fukushima Daiichi plant and other power companies, has had huge advertising expenses, especially since the Fukushima nuclear accident. Advertisements from power companies such as TEPCO, which is an excellent advertiser who pays huge advertising fees, will increase the profits of major media companies. Consequently, pointing out the problems and dangers of the nuclear power business must be avoided by a major media company that pursues profits because it will displease the power companies promoting nuclear power generation. In fact, it has been reported that after a private television station produced a critical documentary on nuclear power plant reprocessing, one power company stepped down from being a sponsor of another of the station's programs (Hasegawa, 2012). Advertisements from the Japan Atomic Energy Foundation, which receives support from power companies, have been featured in major newspapers. Under these circumstances, it can be said that power companies, and nuclear power-related companies including reactor manufacturers and construction companies that undertake nuclear power plant construction, collaborated with

politicians, bureaucrats, and scholars to form a group promoting nuclear power (Onishi, 2011). Indeed, one of the consequences of such a nourished safety myth eventuated in the lack of correct information being spread broadly to the general public by the media during the Fukushima nuclear disaster of 2011. It should also be noted that, according to reports covering the administration led by the then Prime Minister Junichiro Koizumi, a major advertising agency has the power to dominate information and suppress media for the government and the ruling party whose media campaigns it takes charge of (Uesugi, 2006).

3. In terms of media scandals, the processes of gathering and editing data generally reflect the policy of the mainstream media, and the editorial policy of each of the newspapers. The full-time reporters, called *ban kisha* in Japanese, are attached to their political counterparts, maintaining specific nearness, which in turn influences their way of coverage. This intimate relationship is conditioned by the fact that reporters identify with the politicians they cover, while their careers advance along with the politician's career (Noble, 2000). They are part of the infamous reporters' club system called *kisha kurabu*, which largely controls political news coverage including the wording of power-sensitive news. It provides the official reporters with privileged access to politicians (Prusa, 2017).

This can explain the ways of systematic control of the media by the powers in Japan. The press club, as a place where power controls information, has become stronger despite continuous criticism. According to Feldman (1993), however, press clubs exist in the US and other

countries as well, and similar mechanisms can be found such as between the press club and the lobby, and a formal association of reporters from newspapers and broadcasters working out of the Palace of Westminster in the UK.

4. A Japanese liberal national newspaper, the Asahi Shimbun, won the Japanese Pulitzer Prize for its investigative reporting after the Fukushima nuclear disaster on the “nuclear village”, the proponents of nuclear power in industry, politics, government, unions, media and academia. However, the same team at the Asahi wrote a story that suggested the workers at the Fukushima Daiichi plant had disobeyed the orders of the manager and fled to another plant 10 kilometers away, belittling the prevailing heroic narrative of the Fukushima Fifty (Kingston, 2018). Then, just as the Asahi faced orchestrated attacks after an apology concerning incorrect articles printed in the 1980s and 1990s about comfort women during the Second World War, the right-wing newspapers Yomiuri Shimbun and Sankei Shimbun leaked copies of the false testimony the Asahi’s story was based on (Fackler, 2017), and further attacked the Asahi over the overstated interpretation of the workers’ evacuation. Other liberal media showed no solidarity with Asahi which faced rapid declines in circulation, leading the company to retract the story and punish key reporters for their damage to the Asahi image, and not handling the concept of investigative journalism appropriately.

The Asahi led the way in investigating two cronyism scandals involving private-school projects linked to Abe throughout 2017. It also spotlighted a series of information disclosure practices that revealed a culture of deception

aimed at avoiding government accountability (Kingston, 2018). LDP leaders, however, singled out the Asahi by name and said the media is at war with the government. In spite of this, Asahi continues to draw attention to subjects often ignored by other media.

5. Japan does not refuse communism as much as the United States. As proof the Japan Communist Party is a legal party and has secure seats in Parliaments and local assemblies. Instead of anti-communism, hard nationalism based on national interest as well as terrorism is emerging in the Japanese political landscape, and it plays a significant role in helping shift the ideological consensus rightwards. However, such control of media through intimidation or flak can also be seen in the US, UK and other democracies since the 1970s. McNeil (2012) finds that “Japan has a modern, competitive, pluralistic, and open mass media, with thousands of outlets and a diversity of view”. As Pharr and Krauss (1996) pointed out, freedom and restraint coexist in both controlled and pluralistic elements, therefore, it is not different to other democratic countries.

3. In conclusion

Chomsky argues that the greatest role of mass media relates to the realization of tyranny by the industrial-military sector by building a national agreement convenient for the government (Chomsky, 2004). Although it is not always the case, mass media manages information and maintains public opinion in order to maintain the current system. It seems actually possible to operate, apart from its success or failure. However, the overemphasis on information manipulation from

the conservative standpoint should not be spared from criticism for being too one-sided. It is equally possible for mass media to manage information and manipulate public opinion from the liberal standpoint. In fact, at a meeting of broadcasting organization heads, the chief of news at TV Asahi confessed that the news had backed up the launch of a non-LDP coalition government with his direction during the campaign for the general election in 1993, resulting in his subsequent resignation and summons by the House of Representatives (Yamada, 2002).

Mass media often took part in the outbreak of war, despite the existence of mass media in the past that consistently struggled against reporting war with death. Chomsky referred to the case of the United States. Similarly, during the Pacific War, all Japanese mass media was under state control with severe restrictions on the press. At that time, media was forced to take part in the war. According to Fujii (2010), what mattered to Chomsky was that the media freely took part in the war, even though the media was not specifically forced to cooperate with the state nor the war. In other words, media's role was not to obscure the people actively, but merely to silence reporting of the facts or commentary that we now consider should be reported (Fujii, 2010).

If we agree with Chomsky's suggestion that all the messages delivered by the media are biased and should be regarded as propaganda distributed by the person(s) in power, then that means denial of journalistic criticism of the power may be overstated. Based on this researcher's working experience as a journalist for a Japanese national newspaper, The Asahi Shimbun, the function of investigative journalism as represented through reports of the Watergate scandal and the Pentagon

Papers in the US, and Japan's Recruit scandal which the Asahi scooped in 1988 and which later led to the resignation of the then prime minister cannot be neglected. On the other hand, while media has proved that it can remove particular persons from power, Chomsky's assertion can be also supported by the fact that the power structure and control mechanism are completely unchanged in Japan, as can be seen through the fact that Japan's LDP has continued to be the ruling party for 62 years out of 66 years after its launch in 1955.

In conclusion, with the analysis through all the five filters, the propaganda model seems to have penetrated Japan as well. Despite Chomsky's overstatements, the model may help effectively review the current healthiness of the democracy through the relations between the powers, such as the media, government, business owners and intellectual leaders. Similarly, as Japanese media is not considered to have the freedom to deal with what might be considered volatile content, and rates at a low 67 in the 2021 Reporters Without Borders' World Press Freedom Index, it would stand to reason that more attention should be paid to tuition of newspaper articles from so-called healthier democracies, such as New Zealand, Canada, or Australia (rated as # 8, # 14, and # 25 respectively). Indeed, in order to fulfill the concept of a Japan that can better hold its own on the international forefront, it would be imperative to familiarize students with both media based in Japan as well as abroad, reported in both Japanese and English.

Bibliography

Ariyama, T. 1986. *Churitsu Shimbun No Keisei: Meiji-chuki Niokeru Seifu To Asahi Shimbun*

- [The formation of Impartial Newspapers: Japanese Government and the Asahi Shimbun in mid-Meiji Period], Seijo Bungei, (117), pp. 30-54.
- Chomsky, N., 2002. Media control: The spectacular achievements of propaganda (Vol. 7). Seven Stories Press.
- Feldman, O., 1993. Politics and the news media in Japan. University of Michigan Press.
- Herman, E.S. and Chomsky, N., 2010. Manufacturing consent: The political economy of the mass media. Random House.
- Choi, J. (2010). Banishment of Murdoch's Sky in Japan: A Tale of David and Goliath?. Television, Japan and Globalization. Ann Arbor: Centre for Japanese Studies, The University of Michigan, 7-26 .
- Fackler, M., 2016. A pooch after all? The Asahi Shimbun's foiled foray into watchdog journalism. In Press Freedom in Contemporary Japan (pp. 54-69). Routledge.
- Fujii, M., 2010. *N.Chomsky No Seiakusetsu-teki Media Ron: Masukomi Kisei No Ronri Wo Kangaeru*[The media theory of N. Chomsky that its nature is basically evil: think about the logic of mass media regulation]. Collection of Papers at the School of Social Science, Waseda University, (16), pp. 283-298. [Accessed 2 Nov 2021] https://waseda.repo.nii.ac.jp/?action=repository_action_common_download&item_id=16159&item_no=1&attribute_id=162&file_no=1
- Hafez, K. 2007. The myth of media globalization. Polity.
- Hasegawa, H., 2012. Noam Chomsky: His Linguistic Theory and Political Economy Swiping and related phenomena in English and other languages. Senshu University Institute of Humanities annual report, 42, pp. 153-177. [Accessed 2 Nov 2021] http://ir.acc.senshu-u.ac.jp/index.php?action=pages_view_main&active_action=repository_action_common_download&item_id=4804&item_no=1&attribute_id=15&file_no=1&page_id=13&block_id=52
- Japan Today, 2016. What do you think are some of the main differences between the way Japanese and Western media report the news? [Accessed 2 Nov 2021] <https://japantoday.com/category/have-your-say/what-do-you-think-are-some-of-the-main-differences-between-the-way-japanese-and-western-media-report-the-news>
- Kingston, J., 2018. Watchdog Journalism in Japan Rebounds but Still Compromised. The Journal of Asian Studies, 77(4), pp. 881-893.
- McNeill, D., 2012. Media intimidation in Japan. Electronic journal of contemporary Japanese studies.
- Mosco, V., 2008. Political economy of the media. The International Encyclopedia of Communication.
- Noble, G.W., 2000. Let a hundred channels contend: Technological change, political opening, and bureaucratic priorities in Japanese television broadcasting. Journal of Japanese Studies, pp. 79-109.
- Onishi, N., 2011. Safety myth. Left Japan ripe for nuclear crisis. New York Times. [Accessed 2 Nov 2021] <http://www.nytimes.com/2011/06/25/world/asia/25myth.html>.
- Oyama, S., 2015. Japanese creative industries in globalization. In Routledge Handbook of New Media in Asia (pp. 334-344). Routledge.
- Oyama, S. and Lolli, D., 2016. When the Media Do Not Quite Converge: The Case of Fuji TV

- vs. Livedoor. Media Convergence in Japan.
- Pharr, S.J. and Krauss, E.S. eds., 1996. Media and politics in Japan. University of Hawaii Press.
- Pedro-Carañana, J., Broudy, D. and Klaehn, J., 2018. The Propaganda Model Today. University of Westminster Press.
- Prusa, I., 2017. Mediating Scandal in Contemporary Japan. French Journal for Media Research, 7.
- Shimazaki, K. 1968. *Gendai Shimbun No Genri: News Kakou-ron* [Principles of Modern Newspapers: Theories of News Processing], Kobundo-shinsha.
- Sivek, S.c. "Do Journalists Need a Journalism Degree? Educators, Practitioners Disagree", MediaShift, [Accessed 2 Nov 2021] <http://mediashift.org/2013/08/do-journalists-need-a-journalism-degree-educators-practitioners-disagree/>
- '2021 World Press Freedom Index', *Reporters Without Borders*, [Accessed 5 Nov 2021] <https://rsf.org/en/ranking>
- Uesugi, T., 2006. *Koizumi no Shori, Media no Haiboku* [Koizumi's Victory, Media's Defeat]. Shoushisha, Tokyo.
- Yamada, K., 2004. *Mass Media Kenkyu Josetsu; Kenkyu Taisho To Shite No Shimbun* [The Prologue of Mass Media Research; Newspapers as a Research Target]. The Journal of International Media, Communication, and Tourism Studies, 2, pp. 79-94. [Accessed 2 Nov 2021] <https://eprints.lib.hokudai.ac.jp/dspace/bitstream/2115/18915/1/%E5%9B%BD%E9%9A%9B%E5%BA%83%E5%A0%B12.PDF>

Endorsement



UK newspapers have clear positions in politics and make political endorsements. These show the front page of some broadsheets and tabloids on Brexit Referendum or Brexit Day.